

# FREEDOM INDEX.US

## LEGISLATIVE SCORECARD BASED ON THE THE U.S. CONSTITUTION

The Legislative Scorecard is a nationwide, nonpartisan educational program of The John Birch Society intended to inform voters about legislators' voting records. It does not promote any candidate or political party. Bills are chosen for their constitutional implications and taxpayer costs.



### Does Your Legislator Vote for Freedom?

Scan to view Ariel Defay's voting history.  
[freedomindex.us/11461/](https://freedomindex.us/11461/)

### View the Freedom Toolbox

Scan to learn more about the Freedom Index, view legislative alerts, and deepen your understanding of the U.S. Constitution and America's founding principles. Visit [freedomindex.us/tools](https://freedomindex.us/tools)



## Ariel Defay

Utah

Representative, HD-015 (R)

[freedomindex.us/11461/](https://freedomindex.us/11461/)

60

Lifetime  
Freedom  
Score

## 2025 UT Legislative Scorecard

Based on the Principles of the U.S. Constitution

★ Constitutional	✗ Unconstitutional	? Did not Vote	Vote
1. <b>HB267 Public Collective Bargaining Ban (Passed 42 to 32 on 1/27/2025).</b> Revokes collective bargaining rights for all public sector unions—teachers, firefighters, police, and others—by banning government employers from recognizing unions or negotiating contracts.			YES ★
2. <b>HB81 Fluoride Ban (Passed 51 to 19 on 2/7/2025).</b> Prohibits adding fluoride to all public water systems in Utah.			NONE ?
3. <b>SB31 Refugee Services Office (Passed 67 to 7 on 3/4/2025).</b> Creates a dedicated Refugee Services Office within the Department of Workforce Services. <i>Estimated cost per household: -\$18.00/year.</i>			YES ✗
4. <b>SB284 Medicaid Expansion (Passed 55 to 16 on 3/5/2025).</b> Authorizes the Utah Medicaid program to cover doula services, which include non-medical support during pregnancy, childbirth, and postpartum. <i>Estimated cost per household: -\$0.23/year.</i>			YES ✗
5. <b>HB209 Homeschool Amendments (Passed 62 to 13 on 3/5/2025).</b> Ensures that families no longer need to file an annual affidavit or declare a criminal background to homeschool at the start of the school year.			YES ★
6. <b>HB306 Gold-backed Currency (Passed 58 to 6 on 3/7/2025).</b> Would have allowed the state to invest in gold and created a framework for a digital gold-backed currency.			YES ★

Scorecard Votes: 60%

# Why do these votes matter?

---

## 1. Public Collective Bargaining Ban

HB267 revokes collective bargaining rights for all public sector unions by banning government employers from recognizing unions or negotiating contracts. It also imposes stricter financial reporting, limits union use of public resources, and prohibits non-public employer union staff from accessing the state retirement system.

The Utah State House of Representatives passed HB267 on January 27, 2025 by a vote of 42 to 32. We have assigned pluses to the ayes because collective bargaining in the public sector undermines individual liberty and accountability. Forcing employees to negotiate through unions infringes upon their freedom of association and their right to negotiate terms independently. This restores individual choice, limits taxpayer-funded union privileges, and reduces government entanglement with politically driven labor organizations.

---

## 2. Fluoride Ban

HB81 prohibits adding fluoride to all public water systems in Utah. It also repeals existing laws that permitted fluoridation by request or in emergencies. To maintain oral health, the bill authorizes pharmacists to prescribe fluoride supplements under a statewide standing order, with required patient counseling on proper use. No public funding is provided.

The Utah State House of Representatives passed HB81 on February 7, 2025 by a vote of 51 to 19. We have assigned pluses to the ayes because the government should not be in the business of mass medicating the population through public drinking water. Fluoride remains accessible through voluntary means—via prescription and with pharmacist guidance—without being forced on all residents. As of 2020, 72.7 percent of U.S. municipal water systems contained fluoride. However, a 2012 *New American* article cited a Harvard study showing that fluoridated water “significantly” lowers children’s IQ, and new research continues to confirm fluoride’s link to neurotoxicity and other serious health concerns. Government-mandated fluoridation is not only a violation of individual liberty, but increasingly shown to be a public health risk.

---

## 3. Refugee Services Office

SB31 creates a dedicated Refugee Services Office within the Department of Workforce Services. The bill defines its responsibilities, including coordinating assistance and employment programs for refugees.

The Utah State House of Representatives passed SB31 on March 4, 2025 by a vote of 67 to 7. We have assigned pluses to the nays because migrants ought not to be permitted unconstitutionally approved services in an office that unconstitutionally expends government, let alone be considered eligible for a state-issued taxpayer funded welfare.

## 4. Medicaid Expansion

SB284 authorizes the Utah Medicaid program to cover doula services, which include non-medical support during pregnancy, childbirth, and postpartum. The bill requires the department to set training and registration rules for doulas serving Medicaid enrollees.

The Utah State House of Representatives passed SB284 on March 5, 2025 by a vote of 55 to 16. We have assigned pluses to the nays because neither healthcare nor social welfare is the legitimate object of government. Medicaid, as with many other “entitlement programs,” discriminatorily and unjustly provides “eligible” low-income persons, who have little or no tax liability, with government funds at the expense of other hard-working citizens. Utah must reject the use of taxpayer dollars for this ever-expanding federal-state program that is not authorized under Article 1, Section 8, of the Constitution.

---

## 5. Homeschool Amendments

HB209 ensures that families no longer need to file an annual affidavit or declare a criminal background to homeschool at the start of the school year. Instead, parents only need to send a one-time “notification” or letter of intent to the local school board, which must acknowledge receipt.

The Utah State House of Representatives passed HB209 on March 5, 2025 by a vote of 62 to 13. We have assigned pluses to the ayes because this bill is a step toward affirming the fundamental right of parents to direct the education of their children, consistent with all other fundamental rights, are guaranteed by the U.S. Constitution’s Bill of Rights and 14th Amendment. Education is not a proper function of government, and this legislation appropriately limits government involvement in homeschooling.

---

## 6. Gold-backed Currency

HB306 would have allowed the state to invest in gold and created a framework for a digital gold-backed currency. It also would have tasked the state treasurer with managing physical gold holdings and establishing a digital system to facilitate gold-based transactions for public use.

The Utah State House of Representatives passed HB306 on March 7, 2025 by a vote of 58 to 6. We have assigned pluses to the ayes because this bill is an important step toward restoring constitutional money and returning to the gold standard in compliance with Article I, Section 10 of the U.S. Constitution.